

RELEASE IN PART  
B6

**From:** Sidney Blumenthal [REDACTED]  
**Sent:** Friday, October 5, 2012 12:22 AM  
**To:** H  
**Subject:** Re: H: Because I like to waste my time. Sid  
**Attachments:** biden\_debate\_memo\_2\_100412.docx

B6

Yet another:

CONFIDENTIAL

October 5, 2012

For: John Martilla  
From: Sidney Blumenthal  
Re: Biden Debate (Memo 2)

1. Biden should adopt a divide and conquer strategy in the debate with Paul Ryan that keeps him on the defensive and undermines Romney's motives while staying substantive. At the same time, Biden should force Ryan to admit his differences with Romney *and* that Romney embraces his right-wing panaceas. Ryan must be made into the instrument to define Romney as two-faced, hypocritical *and* dangerously far right. Biden can make Ryan do this work. Turn him into the witness against Romney.
2. Biden should force Ryan to admit that Romney's statement about Obama cutting Medicare by \$716 million is not only false but that Ryan knows better and Romney should, too. That exact figure is, of course, in Ryan's budget. He knows that Obama has not cut Medicare, but is cutting waste, fraud, abuse and overcharging from providers. Biden: Why did Romney five times misrepresent that figure in the debate that appears in your own proposal? Have you never discussed this important proposal of yours with him? Does he not know where you stand? Does he agree or disagree with you? If he agrees with you, why did he attack your policy to try to damage the President? Is Romney completely unfamiliar with this policy, or is he misrepresenting it? Do you think you should bring your position to his attention perhaps again so he doesn't commit that mistake again?
3. Romney stayed on taxes as much as possible during the first debate because he believed that issue most favored him and the Republicans. On Romney's claim that he doesn't have a tax cut for the wealthy that will blow a \$5 trillion hole in the budget, Biden can push Ryan to the wall. Biden: You know and I know that the nonpartisan, independent Tax Policy Center reported that Romney's tax cut that would benefit the upper, upper bracket will blow a \$5 trillion hole in the budget. You're the policy wonk; you've read the report. It's OK. You're among serious policy people up here. (Ryan will try to interrupt; don't let him.) And you know and I know that Romney says he'll fill this crater by closing loopholes and deductions, but that he hasn't said which ones. Come on, Paul, it's just the two of us up here. You can tell me: Is it the mortgage deduction he's going to get rid of? The charitable deduction? We know it's not that loophole for the windfall royalties for the big oil companies because he opposes that, right? But

if Romney hasn't shared this information about which deductions he'll eliminate with you maybe you should tell us that right now. You're the policy guy, so you can tell us. Let me get this straight: You are saying that Romney claimed before the whole country in the last debate that he has a well thought out plan but that in fact he has no actual hard numbers at all. Or is there a secret plan? Now, you've said you read that Tax Policy Center report on the \$5 trillion Romney budget buster. So you also know that the Tax Policy Center experts, lacking any numbers from Romney, who won't provide them, tried to fill that immense \$5 trillion hole by coming up with potential deductions that might be eliminated. And you know what? They couldn't do it. The numbers don't add up. It can't be done. The experts can't do it. Now, you have read that report, Paul? Have you told Governor Romney that his big tax plan just doesn't compute? Have you mentioned that report to Romney? How did that discussion go? Or did you not mention that the central policy of the entire Romney economic approach just doesn't add up?

4. Stay on Medicare as much as possible, as much as Romney kept his debate on taxes. Biden: Exactly when did Romney agree with your plan to turn Medicare into a voucher system? Tell us about that conversation. Did you convince him or was he already in favor of dismantling Medicare? Go through exactly who will pay more and how much under the Romney voucher plan that tears apart Medicare. Ryan will contest this. Throw Romney's quote at Ryan: "You aren't entitled to your own facts."
5. Romney's falsehoods during the first debate provide a road map for the second debate to use policies at Ryan. See: <http://thinkprogress.org/politics/2012/10/04/958801/at-last-nights-debate-romney-told-27-myths-in-38-minutes/>
6. Go at Ryan's extreme positions, but always in the context of Romney, never in isolation. Biden: Romney is aware of your extreme position on women's rights, he vetted your positions, and he agrees with them, doesn't he? Enumerate Ryan's extreme positions on women's right and ask if Romney agrees with each one, starting with Ryan's sponsorship of the Personhood Amendment that would criminalize abortion, some forms of contraception and in-vitro fertilization.
7. Dream Act. Biden: Now, Paul, I know you admired Ronald Reagan and I watched your tireless support for George W. Bush. Ronald Reagan was for the equivalent of the Dream Act in his time. George W. Bush was for the Dream Act. But you and Romney think Reagan and Bush were wrong, don't you?
8. In foreign policy, Ryan will run through the talking points about U.S. weakness and decline under Obama. Biden: You know, I was a member of the Senate Foreign Relations Committee, which I chaired, for decades before I became Vice President. And I want to say as strongly as I can, demagoguery about domestic policy is dishonest but demagoguery about foreign policy is dangerous.

-----Original Message-----

From: H <HDR22@clintonemail.com>  
 To: 'sbwhoep' [redacted]  
 Sent: Thu, Oct 4, 2012 10:49 pm  
 Subject: Re: H: Because I like to waste my time. Sid

And because you care about our country.

From: Sidney Blumenthal [mailto:[redacted]]  
 Sent: Thursday, October 04, 2012 11:39 AM  
 To: H  
 Subject: H: Because I like to waste my time. Sid

B6

B6

## CONFIDENTIAL

October 4, 2012

For: John Martilla  
From: Sidney Blumenthal  
Re: It Now Depends On Biden

1. This is no time for excuses, looking for silver linings, or claiming that Obama won on this or that point.
2. Whatever Obama was advised for the debate and whatever his own responsibility, his advisers failed to understand the dynamics and imperatives of the debate.
3. Whatever the many opportunities Obama squandered, at no point did he communicate the gravity of the election. He utterly failed to explain the stakes.
4. Whatever detailed policies Obama cited, at no point did he offer any theme whatsoever, or explain how his policies, despite Republican resistance, have laid the foundation for recovery.
5. Obama utterly failed to understand Romney's strategic objective in the debate: to reposition himself as more centrist while emitting dog whistles to the right—"etch-a-sketch." Instead, Obama graciously conceded all that centrist ground to Romney by his elaborate praise of how Romney had enacted health care with Democratic support in Massachusetts—rather than pointing to Romney's cynical partisan hypocrisy, refusal to stand by health care in Massachusetts and dishonesty in his attacks on Obamacare. Obama could not have served Romney better.
6. For 90 minutes, Obama failed to mention even once: women and Hispanics. And he forgot that Obamacare covers preexisting conditions, women's reproductive health, young people to age 26 under their parents' insurance, and prevents bankruptcies; the Republican congressional assaults on contraception, women's rights and reproductive health; the Dream Act; his student loan bill; etc.
7. For 90 minutes, Obama failed to mention Paul Ryan and how Romney adopted his budgetary priorities, which have no known statistical basis, would destroy 100 years of progress by Democratic and Republican administrations alike, and throw the economy into recession.
8. Obama's closing statement, explaining his understanding of the nation, was bizarre in the extreme, historically false and seemingly ignorant (the point of the United States apparently being "free enterprise"), and to the right of Romney, who at least cited the Constitution and the Declaration of Independence and political democracy (another lapsed opportunity for Obama, who failed to mention Republican voter suppression efforts, every one knocked down by the courts).
9. The political consequences of the first debate may not mean that Obama will lose the election. Its structure still favors him. But the momentum that was building for greater Democratic Party gains has been thwarted and will be difficult if not impossible to recreate. Obama's performance has inflicted invisible damage on the party—what will not happen.
10. The responsibility for stopping the bleeding rests squarely with Biden, not Obama. Obama cannot try to redo his debate on the fly the day after. He would appear as attempting to do what he failed to do. He would underscore his failure. Biden is the next up with the vice presidential

debate and should bear the burden of carrying the attack. He should attack now, today, and continue ceaselessly into the debate on October 11.

11. What Biden should say: Romney said in the debate that no one is entitled to their own facts. That begins with Romney. We cannot have an honest debate unless we deal in facts and the truth. So let's clear away the falsehoods. Romney's falsehoods fall into two categories: One, brazen lies, and, two, 180 degree reversals of previous positions while claiming they were his all along. Let's go through Romney's top ten lies...
12. Having done this for a week, Biden should open his debate with this same statement, declaring that there cannot be an honest debate until the falsehoods are cleared away. He must do this in the debate even if he's been doing this for the previous week in order to reach the largest possible audience to define Romney as a liar, to demonstrate that his "victory" in the first debate was based on falsehoods and therefore illegitimate, and to present an aggressive, spirited case in contrast to Obama's listless performance.
13. Biden must do this now. Democrats cannot wait for Obama's next debate in two weeks. If Biden does this work, he will reverse Romney's gain and establish the basis for Obama to give a very different kind of performance to project strength without having to do all the remedial labor in the second debate.
14. Biden must articulate the gravity of the election, the immense stakes. After defining Romney the liar, he must state the theme that the Obama administration has fought against relentless Republican obstruction to lay the foundation for recovery and that the administration has plans to secure and expand it, and create a new period of growth and progress. And: Romney and the Republicans are waging an assault on the rights of Americans—women's rights, Hispanics aspiring to the American Dream, every citizen who has the constitutional right to the vote, and every citizen who now will have the right to health care. Obama will protect the rights of all Americans; Romney wants to take them away. Obama will go forward; we can't go back.