

RELEASE IN PART
B6

From: Abedin, Huma <AbedinH@state.gov>
Sent: Saturday, December 3, 2011 10:16 AM
To: H
Subject: Fw: Update for Secstate

From martin, update on last night.

From: Martin Indyk [redacted]
Sent: Saturday, December 03, 2011 09:18 AM
To: Abedin, Huma
Cc: Baxter, Shawn; Mary Fox [redacted]; Martin Indyk [redacted]
Subject: Update for Secstate

Hi Huma,

Thought it would be important to give the Secretary an update on last night's events at the Saban Forum. She should be aware that Leon was his usual blunt self, expressing considerable frustration with Israel ("Just get to the table, goddamit!), and warning Israel in detail of the dire unintended consequences of an Israeli military strike on Iran. He also urged them to step up their diplomatic game, mend fences with Turkey, reach out to Egypt, etc. It was "tough love." Some in the audience, like Tzipi, LOVED it. And others, like Joe Lieberman and Dan Meridor, were quite upset ("It's not Bibi's fault - he wants to negotiate.")

President Clinton was more subtle. His first point was that the Palestinians should take advantage of Bibi handing over the tax revenues to go back to the table and put him on the spot. He said that Bibi is quite capable of holding contradictory positions in his own mind and it was important that he be put in a position where he has to decide which position he is going to take. He spent a lot of time on Iran, explaining the complexities of the situation. He then said, "If I were you and I were going to bomb Iran, I should would want a peace process with the Palestinians going forward before I did that so everybody would know that I was trying to make peace with the Palestinians before I went to war with Iran." Everybody in the audience nodded and applauded.

Martin
+1 202 797 6401
[redacted]

On Dec 1, 2011, at 1:22 PM, "Martin Indyk" [redacted] wrote:

Hi Huma,

I thought you'd like a heads up on the range of questions I'm thinking of asking the Secretary:

1. Democratic Change:
 - You're just back from assessing the political thaw in Myanmar; free elections just took place in Egypt; what do you make of these democratic trends? Is it all good news for the United States?
 - Should we be concerned about the Islamists winning in Egypt/Tunisia/Morocco? Do you think the Israel-Egypt peace treaty could be in jeopardy?
 - Syria: Is there a strategic opportunity to advance democracy and deal a blow to Iran? What tools to do we have to effect regime change in Damascus? Are we on the same page with the Turks on this?

2. Peace Process:

- At the Saban Forum last year you laid out a plan for robust engagement; now it seems that the United States doesn't want to have anything to do with it. Is there a danger in just letting things be, or is the status quo actually sustainable for the time being?
- You and the President and others (Mitchell, Ross, etc.) invested a lot of effort in trying to revive negotiations without a lot of success. Do you sometimes wonder (as I do) whether Oslo is dead?

3. Iran:

- Secretary Panetta warned Israel's Defense Minister last week about the unintended consequences of a military strike on Iran's nuclear facilities. General Dempsey noted yesterday that the United States and Israel have differences about how to deal with Iran's nuclear program. As Iran gets closer to the nuclear threshold is there a growing divergence between the United States and Israel?
- French President Sarkozy is pushing for harsh sanctions on Iran's central bank and a ban on oil imported from Iran. Is the United States willing to go that far?

4. U.S.-Israel Relations:

- Every decade, the U.S.-Israel relationship manages to reinvent itself: partners in the defense of freedom during the Cold War; partners in the promotion of peace during the Clinton-Rabin-Barak years; partners in fighting terror during the Bush-Sharon era; partners in curbing Iran's nuclear program during the Obama-Netanyahu first terms. Where will the next partnership be? Attacking Iran; resolving the Palestinian conflict; promoting Arab democracy? Or are U.S. and Israeli interests beginning to diverge?
- Five years from now, U.S. forces will be gone from Iraq and Afghanistan and the United States won't be importing any oil from the Gulf. Are we witnessing a strategic shift in American interests away from the Middle East and toward East Asia? If so, what will that mean for Israel?

If there are any you would like me to stay away from, or any that you would prefer me to ask, please let me know.

Many thanks.

Martin